

A NATIONAL CONFERENCE ON ELEMENTS OF NATIONAL POWER (EoNP)

(A CONCEPT PAPER SUBMITTED TO FEDERAL MINISTER PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT & REFORM)

BACKGROUND

1. What makes a nation superior or inferior to others? What should be the focus areas of nation's development? What elements should be put together in order to make a nation prosper? These questions have been the topics of debate since ancient times. The concept of so called 'Factors or Elements of National Power' has evolved with time. It has taken new shape and meanings with the advent of capitalism, industrial revolution, modern transportation & communication and recently, the internet.

2. Power is the ability to influence the behavior of others to get a desired outcome. Some of the factors that are considered as elements of national power by most scholars include geography, natural resources, population, leadership, quality of governance, extent of economic development, industrial capacity, technology, military, ideology, national character & morale, diplomacy, foreign support, inter alia.

CONSIDERATIONS FOR ANALYSIS OF NATIONAL POWER

3. Many scholars such as Frankel, Morgenthau, Organski, Abdul Said, to name a few, have tried to group these factors. Some of these classifications include permanent & temporary, natural & social, and tangible & intangible. It can be appreciated that even boundaries between these classifications seem to wither away with time - factors once considered permanent such as geography can prove to be temporary. Similarly natural factors such as population change shape quickly due to globalization factors bringing quick social changes.

4. All elements of national power are dependent on each other through a complex network of causes and effects. Depending on a nation's geography and relations with other nations, strength in a few elements can cover up for lack in all others. As a corollary, lack in a few critical elements can render all other elements useless. National power can thus be considered as a complex concept, which is highly context dependent. A certain combination of national elements may make a nation a super power in one part of the world or in a point in time, but may not be enough in a different context.

5. National power is a relative concept, depending upon how well other nations are doing. A nation's true power is always relative to its neighbors, rivals, competitors - basically any other nation with whom one may come in comparison.

MEASUREMENT OF NATIONAL POWER

6. The measurement of a nation's power is a difficult matrix because it involves the task of measuring and analyzing (quantitatively & qualitatively) a large number of tangible and intangible factors/elements. The need to analyze the actual and potential power of a nation further makes the task difficult. However, political scientists advocate the measurement of national power in respect of following three factors:

Domain of National Power

a. Defined as “the set of persons whose behavior is significantly changed by the application of power.” Domain is divided into internal and external domains. Internal domain is constituted by the territory and population within the boundaries of a country. External domain includes those territories and populations outside that belong to its ‘sphere of influence’.

b. The internal domain can be measured in terms of population, area and gross national product. The external domain can be analyzed in terms of spheres of influence, alliances, dependencies and the degree of penetration in the political processes of other countries. The external domain of USA can be measured in terms of its alliances like NATO etc, and the number of its foreign military bases and areas of influence in different parts of the world.

c. However, measuring of domain is a difficult task. The quality of alliance relation is not measureable. NATO continues to be in existence and has registered an expansion as well. However, it now operates with a relatively less effective and less useful role. We cannot ascertain exactly as to how much influence US has over France, Germany or Turkey. As such, measurement of domain of power can be done only in a limited way.

Range of National Power

a. Defined as “the difference between the highest reward and the worst punishment which a power holder can bestow or inflict upon some persons in his/her domain”. Range is the intensity of the power exercised upon others. The internal range or intensity of power can be measured by taking into account the use of force and punishment as well as of reward or distribution of values for exercising power over the people at home. A democratic government uses influence, persuasion and rewards, whereas a tyrant or a dictator uses force and punishment for securing obedience to his policies and laws.

b, The external range or the intensity of the power can be measured in terms of the means which a state actually uses or can use for securing its desired ends and policies. The amount of economic rewards (aid, grant, loans) that a nation gives or receives can indicate the range of power that it has in international relations. However, there exists no specific way to precisely measure the intensity of the power. USA has been the biggest aid giver and the most developed country of the world, yet we cannot exactly measure the intensity of its power over other nations.

Scope of National Power Scope of national power means “the set or collection of all the particular classes of behavior, relations and affairs that are effectively subjected to government power”. Scope consists of all the activities of the government, internal as well as external. The external activities include the demonstration of power to keep others dependent for one thing or the other and to use the interdependence of relations for ones benefit.

PAKISTAN’S CONTEXT

7. Before deliberating on the critical elements of power for Pakistan, it is important to consider the context which Pakistan has to consider to identify and develop its critical elements of national power. Some of the critical contextual aspects are discussed in following paragraphs:

a. **Geography and Associated Challenges and Opportunities** Pakistan is located in one of the most important regions of contemporary world. It can be considered as a crossing point of world’s major energy routes, economic linkages, militarily strifed area - besides being a place of cultural amalgamation. These having several opportunities and challenges, geography, thus has to be a cornerstone while making any analysis on the topic.

b. **Nuclear Power** Pakistan’s nuclear power makes it a country of interest for the entire world. This interest ranges from seekers of military and nuclear help to a concern of safety of this asset.

c. **Military Power and Preparedness** Pakistan, by virtue of its developed military power and technology, is considered as one of the most powerful Islamic countries in the world. Its proximity to the conflict prone Persian Gulf makes this factor even more important and many Islamic countries turn naturally to Pakistan for their military needs.

d. **Economy, Population and Local Consumers** Pakistan has a large economy, which is not heavily dependent on other nations for its basic needs such as agriculture, military and manpower. With its population of 185 million and thus a large

base of local consumers, a well managed economy can see Pakistan rising quickly among other nations.

e. **Terrorism** Pakistan has been a victim of terrorism for decades now. This period has brought significant changes to the country's character - representing challenges and opportunities. Local, regional and global aspects of terrorism have to play an important role in any meaningful analysis of Pakistan's national power.

f. **Quality of Governance** Quality of governance has been a great challenge for Pakistan. Despite having many fundamental economic strengths, the country has struggled in getting its economy to a commensurate level. Governance is also the lynch-pin that puts elements of national power to any use. Governance, thus, has to be a fundamental consideration while analyzing Pakistan's national power.

g. **Quality of Education** Quality of education in Pakistan represents one of the biggest challenges for any meaningful effort towards development. In fact, lack of quality education can be considered as the fundamental evil behind almost all issues faced by Pakistan today.

CRITICAL ELEMENTS OF PAKISTAN'S NATIONAL POWER

8. With the background given above, elements that can be considered most important for Pakistan's national power are discussed below. The discussion includes desired goals for each element and the needs for integration among them:

a. **Geography** Pakistan has to put its unique location, topography, climate and size to good use. Pakistan can be a conduit of energy for the region. It can play a role of economic hub for Central Asian Nations and can be a tourist attraction of choice.

b. **Economy** Pakistan has a semi-industrial economy with a well integrated agricultural sector. It is characterized as an emerging and growth leading economy. However, the country remains stuck in a low-income low-growth trap with an average growth rate of 3.5% (2008-2014). A lot thus needs to be done to put the country on a track of consistent growth; overall architecture of CPEC can be the game changer in this regard.

c. **Military** Pakistan can use its military might to play important role in the region. It can be a moderator for conflicts in the region.

d. **Nuclear Power** Nuclear power has the potential for military superiority and fulfillment of energy needs. With multiple modes of strike capability it ensures a

minimum credible deterrence. This element has to be further harnessed in both these areas.

e. **Governance and Leadership** Rule of law is a major challenge of Pakistan, which itself is a subset of poor governance. Pakistan has to convert this weakness into a strength in short time, if it is to make any meaningful progress on the economic front.

f. **Resilience** Last few decades have brought great challenges on social, economic, ideological and military fronts. Pakistan was dubbed by many as a failed state until 2013 after a very difficult decade marred by incessant terrorism, dwindling economy and an increasing perception of corruption at the highest level. This was exacerbated by increasing international isolation of the country and an ever widening lack of trust between state institutions. However, Pakistan survived these challenges and is being seen as thriving again. Another reflection of Pakistan's resilience was seen during the economic recession at the end of last century which perpetuated for many years. Pakistan was among the nations least affected by this recession. Resilience is Pakistan's fundamental strength and needs to be played on.

g. **Agriculture and other Natural Resources** Pakistan is a food self sufficient nation. Combined with the military power, this aspect is a major element of Pakistan's national power. It has to be ensured that agriculture is continuously developed not only on commercial levels but also on small scale. Besides agriculture, Pakistan has natural resources such as coal, gas, fossil fuel, metals, salt etc. These resources have to be exploited with latest technology to make best use of them.

h. **Population** Pakistan has a large population and provides manpower to many countries in the world. Pakistan's population is socially active, politically vibrant and well connected through different media/information sources. However, the quality of Pakistan's manpower is marred by challenges of:

- (1) Quality of basic education.
- (2) Quality of vocational expertise.
- (3) Quality of higher education.

Besides, different population segments of Pakistan represent different strengths that have to be tapped. For example, people in the north are rugged and tough, thus suitable for military and hard tasks. Similarly, industrious people in the mainland and friendly people in the south present various strengths and opportunities. This element of national power needs to be put to best use by addressing the challenges.

j. **Religion** Pakistan's society is religious. Muslims and non-Muslims both, adhere to their religious basics. This aspect has strengthened the social fabric and has in-built several social strengths such as respect for elders, respect for women etc. However, recently, this strength has turned to a weakness and harmony has given way to intolerance. There is a need to bring fundamental changes in this regard.

k. **Information** A large segment of Pakistan's population uses mobile phones and social media, thus representing great informational power potential. However, no mechanism is in place to channelize this aspect. Deliberations are needed so that this potential can be exploited.

INTEGRATION AMONG ELEMENTS OF NATIONAL POWER

9. As argued earlier, elements of national power have to be recognized, developed and integrated. In absence of such approach towards cohesion, these elements not only remain untapped but may actually turn around and impact the nation negatively. Therefore, there is a need to find exact linkages and cause-and-effect relations between the critical elements of Pakistan's national power deliberated in preceding sections. The idea here is that in order to capitalize upon a particular element of national power, some foundational strengths have to be built into the society - which are brought in by other elements of national power. Thus, national power can only be achieved if the elements of national power are integrated.

A NATIONAL CONFERENCE ON ELEMENTS OF NATIONAL POWER

10. To achieve identification, development and integration of elements of national power for Pakistan, it is proposed that a 3 days national conference may be organized with the following streams for scholarly papers, posters, discussions and addresses by national and international experts:

a. **Channelizing the Population Potential** Pakistan is world's sixth most populous country with an estimated over 190 million inhabitants. It has a large number of expatriates working throughout the world, ranging from unskilled laborers to highly skilled professionals. Overall, Pakistan's HR is hardworking and resilient, with learning and adapting aptitudes. Different areas of Pakistan offer a variety of HR characteristics and skills. Pakistan's society is religious. Muslims and non-Muslims both, adhere to their religious basics. This aspect has strengthened the social fabric and has in-built several social strengths. Recently, this strength has turned to a weakness and harmony has given way to intolerance. There is thus a need to harmonize our society. The extent to which the state has been able to utilize the available potential of its HR requires improvement. This is reflected through low literacy levels, low Human Development Index (0.538, Low) and low Foreign Direct

Investment (approx. US \$ 23.6 billion) needs a thorough analysis and based on the same, a comprehensive improvement plan. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

Equal Opportunity

- (1) Inequality of opportunities (are people able to "be" and "do" desirable things in their life?)
- (2) Women's' contribution in Pakistan's economic growth – opportunities and challenges.
- (3) Contribution of country's elite academic institutions in producing able and capable human resource – a case study.

Global Citizenship Challenges

- (4) Developing the people to be better global citizens.

Diversity

- (5) Cultural, linguistic and ethnic diversity in Pakistan – present perils, their solutions and potential advantages.
- (6) Strengths of HR of diverse origin and suitability for certain skills – analysis of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats.
- (7) Developing the fundamental changes to re-harmonize our religiously vibrant society.

Feeding international job market

- (8) Skill Development – areas of special contemporary attention, considering local and international skills requirement.

b. Economic Potential of Pakistan - Challenges and New Directions

Pakistan's economy is the world's 26th largest economy in terms of purchasing power and 45th in terms of GDP. However, Decades of instability, political disputes, terrorism, regional problems and wars with India have led to a slow economic growth

in Pakistan. It remains stuck in a low-income low-growth trap. While the fall in international oil prices have contributed to narrowing of current account deficit and decreasing deflation, low exports indicate that the country's economic potential remains largely untapped. In his recent address to the state of union, the US president has predicted a similar pattern for upcoming future of Pakistan. What is it that the world can clearly see and we cannot? What all needs to be done to put the country on a track of consistent growth and pull it out of conflicts? Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

Economic Opportunities and Challenges

- (1) Economy and political disputes.
- (2) Cost benefit analysis of Pakistan's positioning in regional disputes.
- (3) Cost benefit analysis of Pakistan's positioning in international disputes.
- (4) Sector wise analysis of Pakistan's economy (different papers for different sectors)

Integration in world economy

- (5) Dynamism in economy – what needs to be done to respond to the changing dynamic of world economy.
- (6) Technology and Pakistan's Economy.
- (7) Economic strategy – getting it out of the rhetoric and making it actionable.

c. **Geographical Strengths - Tapping the Location, Climate, Topography, Size and Opportunities in Regional / Extra-Regional Connectivity** Pakistan has one of the most strategically significant locations in the world, and thus remains in constant attention of the world powers. It is located at the centre of trade routes, oil supply lines and has a critical and significant position considering the affinity for warm waters in the Central Asian Republics. The geography and climate of Pakistan are extremely diverse – ranging from vast deserts to some of the largest glaciers and tallest mountains in the world. It has an area of 796,095 sq km, almost equaling the combined area of UK and France. It has a 990 km long coast line on the Arabian Sea. CPEC; with Gwadar on this coastline being its terminus, is seen as a game changer in the region. This corridor is expected to provide huge opportunities for the populace of Pakistan in shape of jobs, trade opportunities and superior transportation

infrastructure. However, political issues have a potential to mar this great opportunity if not handled wisely. Furthermore, all the other factors seem to be stunting Pakistan's growth instead of complimenting it. What are the factors that we need to understand and exploit in our favor? Which potentials have we failed to appreciate and realize? In which areas, our appreciation of these factors remain a wish-list with no steps in the practical areas? Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

Geographical Advantage

- (1) Pakistan's unique geographical positioning – analysis of untapped advantage areas.
- (2) Pakistan as a regional cultural crossroad – economic and strategic potential.
- (3) Geo-strategic and geo-political perspectives on Pakistan's location.

Geography and Regional/ International Politics

- (4) Diplomatic positioning of Pakistan in regional disputes and its impact on economy.
- (5) Diplomatic positioning of Pakistan in international disputes and its impact on economy.

Regional/Extra-regional Connectivity - CPEC

- (6) Economic potentials of CPEC – proposed areas to ensure Pakistan's readiness for exploiting the potential.
- (7) Political aspects of CPEC.

d. **Military Power - Challenges and Future Directions** Pakistan has the world's 7th largest standing military. Its military is respected in the region and several countries of the Persian Gulf region and North Africa train their military HR in Pakistan. Pakistan is a nuclear power. Its nuclear power has the potential for military superiority in the region and can be a source of fulfillment of the country's energy needs. Military also represents a unified and disciplined institution of the country. This aspect is huge source of power and needs to be exploited. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

- (1) Military's role in development of institutions.
- (2) Civil Nuclear Power – a long term strategy.
- (3) Military and relations with countries in Persian Gulf – a road map for power development and projection.
- (4) Military and relations with countries in CARs – a road map for power development and projection.
- (5) Military and relations with countries in North Africa – a road map for power development and projection.

e. **Diplomacy and International Relations - Challenges and Future Direction**

Diplomacy is the vehicle for realizing a country's power on the external fronts. This not only includes understanding the requirements of other countries and carving win-win arrangements but also progressing consistently towards ongoing requirements such as trade, culture, military relations and the like. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

- (1) Understanding emerging diplomatic trends in the world,
- (2) Pakistan's diplomatic performance vis-à-vis its international clout.
- (3) Ascertaining the areas where we have a diplomatic potential but is not optimally exploited.
- (4) Effects of PM's recent initiative (12 Feb 16, Media News) for selection and appointment of diplomats abroad.

f. **Resilience - Pakistan's Fundamental Strength** Pakistan has been through some of the worst times in its history and its people have been suffering on economic, military, social, and ideological fronts. It has also been through the situations where it was assumed that it would become a failed state due to widespread terrorism, poor economic credentials, corruption, international isolation and repeated military take-overs. These challenges got further compounded by increasing natural disasters across the length and breadth of the country including earthquakes, repeated floods etc. However, Pakistan survived these challenges and in some cases converted these into strengths by apt handling and their management. Another reflection of Pakistan's resilience was seen during the 2005 earthquake when the entire country came together in managing the mammoth difficulties in rehabilitating the displaced and effected population. Pakistan's handling of this

unprecedented earthquake's after effects is now taken as a guideline by International disaster management organizations including UN. Resilience is thus Pakistan's fundamental strength and needs to be played on. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

- (1) What makes Pakistan a resilient nation – exploring the unseen potential?
- (2) Is Pakistan's resilience in ethos, religious beliefs, societal make-up or culture – a case study?
- (3) Is nation's apparent resilience a fundamental source of strength or result of repeated sufferings?

g. **Agriculture and other Natural Resources** Pakistan is a food self sufficient nation. Agriculture needs to be continuously developed. We also have natural resources such as coal, gas, fossil fuel, precious stones, metals, gold etc. Our EEZ and continental shelf have hydrocarbons and oil on the sea bed. These resources need to be exploited to make best use of them. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

- (1) Role of food security in national power.
- (2) Natural resources – enabler or element of national power.
- (3) Lack of natural resources - a case study of Japan as a natural resources-less nation but a reckonable power.
- (4) Are natural resources a wealth or power of a nation?

h. **Using Media and Social Media, Information and Global Connectivity to Advantage – Development of a New Element of National Power** The growth in the internet, social media, telecommunication technologies as well as private sector media groups is challenging the traditional monopoly of the state over information. States must now ensure that their national agenda is projected to domestic and global audiences and consumers through the media. However, propaganda and media only represent a fraction of the full significance of the information spectrum. Pakistan is a country with a large potential of young population. A large percentage of our society has access to mobile phones and interacts on social media. Overall, we are an open society where an average person recognizes his/ her rights and demands them openly. However, this great potential can become a source of lawlessness and anarchy if not channeled properly. There is a need to thoroughly

analyze the potentials of this aspect and find ways to direct it to Pakistan's advantage. Some proposed topics in this stream include (but not limited to):

Social Media

- (1) Emerging trends in social media.
- (2) Channeling the potential to advantage – proposed ways for designing novel methods and apps for positive interactions.

Electronic Media

- (3) Evolution of Pakistan's media and expected future trends.
- (4) Contribution of media towards national interests.
- (5) Potentials of Pakistan's vibrant media vs. accrued outcome.
- (6) Intentional and unintentional consequences of media's actions.
- (7) Government's media handling capacity – roadmaps.

j. **Limitations on Pakistan's National Power** Pakistan has a plethora of sources of national power. However, as a nation, we have not put to use these resources for enhancing country's interests. What has led to internal strifes? What aspects of our national fabric have been exploited to stunt our growth and project us as an intolerant society which is not able to build upon its resources? This stream invites seminal papers for identifications of factors that stop us from exploiting our potential along with proposals and roadmaps for addressing the related challenges.

k. **Novel Ideas and Emerging Trends on Elements of Pakistan's National Power** This stream invites new ideas in the arena of national power. Contributing authors are expected to focus on contemporary challenges and opportunities specific to Pakistan and identify areas / aspects which can be the potential sources of Pakistan's national power. The papers are expected to contribute both on the 'idea' and 'execution plan' formats.

11. Each stream requires detailed analysis so as to decide upon the elements required to be included. These elements may include:

- a. **Scholarly papers** For scholarly papers, 2-3 months time will be given to prospective authors by announcing the dates in advance. Submissions will be evaluated by a panel of experts for decision on inclusion in the conference or otherwise. Approximately 5-10 papers per stream should be targeted for the 3 days conference.
- b. **Posters** Posters and mind-maps bring in novel ideas about concepts. Preparation time, evaluation and number of approved submission in this case will be similar to that of scholarly papers.
- c. **Discussions** The basic concept of this conference is highly intellectual. Therefore, in-depth discussion sessions will be required to scholars on each theme. These discussion sessions will be designed so as to have a senior discussion leader/facilitator and tangible outcomes in shape of recommendations. 2-3 such sessions for each stream are proposed.
- d. **Addresses by National and International Leaders** It is proposed that 1-2 addresses by national and international leaders may be built into the conference for each stream. These addresses will generally be held during the opening sessions on each day and will provide impetus for discussion sessions.
- e. **Focus Group** A focus group of individuals (known for their scholarly work) will be formed, which will steer the conference from an intellectual perspective. This group will be separate from the organizers.
- f. **Publication of Proceedings** Proceedings of the conference will be published in book form and online.
- g. **Special Session** A special session will be required to make a plan for consolidation and integration of the recommendations of this conference. This session will be the fourth day of conference. However, it will only be attended by the focus group behind the conference. Once the plan is made, the focus group will be given 3-4 weeks to come up with the expected outcomes.

EXPECTED OUTCOMES OF THE CONFERENCE

12. The outcomes expected for this conference may include:
 - a. A set of recommendations developed by each stream and moderated by the focus group.
 - b. Short-listing of most important recommendations.

c. A strategy to integrate the most important recommendations in shape of a shared vision* or even integrating it into Vision 2025.

*This vision will then be developed into a comprehensive plan and KPIs for achievement of the plan will be put in place.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Alesina, Alberto and Beatrice Weder. "Do Corrupt Governments Receive Less Foreign Aid?" *The American Economic Review* 92, 4 (September 1, 2002): 1126-1137.
2. Bailes, Alyson J. K. "National Power and Sovereignty: What is the Significance of the European Union's Example?" *American Foreign Policy Interests* 28, 1 (February 2006): 25-36.
3. Clark, B. "Information Operations as a Deterrent to Armed Conflict." *Military Review* (May 1, 2010): 97-104.
4. Hirschman, Albert O. *National Power and the Structure of Foreign Trade*. Berkeley: University of California press, 1945.
5. Kao, Philip Y. "Future Approaches to the Economic Instrument of Power." *JFQ: Joint Force Quarterly* 43 (October 2006): 50-53.
6. Kozloski, Robert. "The Information Domain as an Element of National Power." *Strategic Insights* 8, 1 (January 2009). Available from the Naval Postgraduate School.
7. Reveron, Derek S. "Old Allies, New Friends: Intelligence-Sharing in the War on Terror." *Orbis* 50, 3 (July 1, 2006): 453-468.
8. Scanlon, J. D. "In Defense of Military Public Affairs Doctrine." *Military Review* 87, (May 1, 2007): 92-96.
9. Smith, Anton K. *Turning on the Dime: Diplomacy's Role in National Security*. Carlisle, PA: U.S. Army War College, Strategic Studies Institute, 2007.
10. Smith, Demian. "Improving Public Diplomacy, the Frontline of Soft Power." Master's thesis, Joint Advanced War fighting School, Joint Forces Staff College, 2009.
11. United States Naval Academy, and William Worthington Jeffries. *Geography and National Power*. Annapolis: United States Naval Institute, 1967.